IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS TEXARKANA DIVISION

TEXARI	KANA D	ivision By MI/A.
SCOTT O'GRADY,	§	BY Willelin
	§	·
Plaintiff,	8	
v.	9 § 8	CIVIL ACTION NO. 502CV173
TWENTIETH CENTURY FOX	§	JURY DEMANDED
FILM CORPORATION, and DISCOVERY COMMUNICATIONS,	§ §	ORAL ARGUMENT REQUESTED
INC.,	§	
	§	
Defendants.	Š	

DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION IN LIMINE AND BRIEF IN SUPPORT THEREOF

Defendants Twentieth Century Fox Film Corporation ("Twentieth Century Fox") and Discovery Communications, Inc. ("Discovery") (collectively hereafter "Defendants") file this their Response to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine and Brief in Support Thereof as to the following:

Response to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 6 (Accounting principles relating to Fox's 1. profits)

Plaintiff seeks to exclude any testimony from Twentieth Century Fox based on accounting principles not in accordance with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles ("GAAP"). (Plaintiff Scott O'Grady's Motion in Limine and Brief in Support Thereof [the "Motion"] at 3) Plaintiff contends that such testimony should be barred because it would be irrelevant or, if relevant, would only possess limited probative value substantially outweighed by a tendency to confuse the issues, mislead the jury, and waste time. (Id.)

Plaintiff has not cited a single authority for the proposition that Twentieth Century Fox should be prohibited from introducing testimony relating to the profits for the movie Behind Enemy Lines (the "Movie") based on accounting principles not in accordance with GAAP.

Accordingly, this Court should deny the Motion to the extent it would prohibit Twentieth Century Fox from introducing evidence of its accounting for the Movie utilizing procedures other than under GAAP.

2. Response to Plaintiff's Motion In Limine No. 7 (the Gelb Survey Tape)

Plaintiff seeks to bar any testimony alleging that the videotape used by his expert Gabriel Gelb in conducting the Gelb survey, was not a fair representation of the November 28th ReBroadcast of Discovery Channel's *Behind Enemy Lines: the Scott O'Grady Story*. (Motion at 3-4). According to Plaintiff, Defendants experts Blair and Johnson did not criticize the videotape nor did they find it to be an inappropriate stimulus for the purpose of the Gelb Survey. (Motion at 4).

The referenced testimony from the experts, however, is immaterial. The questions posed to these experts regarding the appropriate "stimulus" is vague, ambiguous and does not address the real issue here which is the plain fact that Plaintiff cannot authenticate the Gelb tape. See Fed. R. Evid. 901 and 402. The tape Gelb used in the survey was the third tape he received. (Exhibit "A" Gelb Depo. at 29:15-18). The tape, labeled "November 28th Combined Discovery Channel" (marked as Exhibit 328 at the Gelb deposition), is a combination of tapes provided by Plaintiff's counsel to Gelb. (Exhibit "A" Gelb Depo. at 31:8-15) Gelb described his acquisition of the tape as follows:

- Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328?
- A. Is that the third tape?
- Q. Yes, that's the third tape.
- A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn.

- Q. Okay. And in fact, it's -the tape is labeled a combined November 28th combined Discovery Channel?
- A. Yes, it is.
- O. Okay. So it's a combination of tapes?
- A. I believe so.
- Q. And were you told that by Counsel?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And what were you told?
- A. That it was the original tape that I saw, plus they had gotten the front part of the program added to that tape.
- O. And do you know who added that to the tape?
- A. No.
- Q. And do you know where it came from?
- A. No.

(Exhibit "A" Gelb Depo. at 31:3-23)

The tape used by Gelb in conducting his survey, therefore, was one cobbled or pieced together from tapes from different sources, the origin of which he does not know. Twentieth Century Fox therefore objects to the tape on the grounds of Rules 402, 403 and 901 of the Federal Rules of Evidence. Moreover, even if the tape is admitted into evidence, which it should not be, Twentieth Century Fox should not be precluded from challenging its admissibility or whether or not it is a "fair representation." *See, e.g., U.S. v. Jones*, 107 F.3d 1147, 1150 n.1 (6th Cir. 1997), *cert. denied*, 521 U.S. 1127 (decision of trial court to admit evidence does not bar challenging authentication before the jury). Accordingly, Plaintiff's attempt to avoid Twentieth Century Fox's challenge to the tape by way of this motion in limine should be denied.

3. Response to Plaintiff's Motion In Limine No. 10 (Reference to the First Amendment)

Plaintiff's Motion In Limine No. 10 seeks to bar Defendants from "discussing, referencing, or arguing the importance, scope, or impact of the First Amendment or that the works at issue in this case are protected by the First Amendment." (Motion at 5). Plaintiff claims that any such references would be irrelevant and prejudicial. *Id*.

Plaintiff's extraordinary request that Defendants be barred from discussing the First Amendment should be denied out of hand. Plaintiff does not cite any authority to support this request nor can any be found where, as here, Defendants have properly plead and briefed their defenses under the First Amendment. Moreover, there has been no finding by this Court that the First Amendment does not apply or that Defendants cannot try this case on the basis of this fundamental Constitutional defense. Accordingly, as there are no grounds or authority to support the Motion, it should be denied.

WHEREFORE, PREMISES CONSIDERED, Defendants request that this Court deny Plaintiff's Motions in Limine 6, 7 and 10.

Respectfully submitted,

JACKSON WALKER L.L.P.

als Blood Charles L. Babcock (Agrerney-in-Charge)

State Bar No. 01479500 Nancy W. Hamilton State Bar No. 11587925

Cedric D. Scott

State Bar No. 24013474 1401 McKinney, Suite 1900

Houston, TX 77010

(713) 752-4200 (713) 752-4221 - Fax

(903) 334-7007 - Fax

George L. McWilliams PATTON, HALTOM, ROBERTS, MCWILLIAMS, & GREER, LLP 2900 St. Michael Drive, 4th Floor Texarkana, Texas 75503 (903) 334-7000

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT TWENTIETH CENTURY FOX FILM **CORPORATION**

DAVIS WRIGHT TREMAINE L.L.P.

By: ZI Frank (Attorney-in-Charge)

Constance M. Pendleton 1500 K Street, N.W., Suite 450 Washington, D.C. 20005-1272 (202) 508-6600

(202) 508-6699 - Fax

Gary L. Bostwick
Davis Wright Tremaine L.L.P.
865 South Figueroa Street, 24th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90017-2566
(213) 633-6800
(213) 633-6899 – Fax

Victor F. Hlavinka ATCHLEY, RUSSELL, WALDROP & HLAVINKA, L.L.P. 1710 Moores Lane P.O. Box 5517 Texarkana, TX 75505-5517 (903) 792-8246 (903) 792-5801 – Fax

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT DISCOVERY COMMUNICATIONS, INC.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

This is to certify that on this 30th day of December, 2003, a true and correct copy of the foregoing Defendants' Response to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine and Brief in Support was served via United States Mail, postage prepaid, upon:

George E. Bowles, Esq. Locke, Liddell & Sapp. L.L.P. 2200 Ross Avenue, Suite 2200 Dallas, Texas 75201

G. William Lavender, Esq. Lavender Law Landmark Building 210 N. State Line, Suite 503 Texarkana, Texas 71854

Laura R. Handman, Esq. Davis Wright Tremaine L.L.P. 1500 K Street, N.W., Suite 450 Washington, D.C. 20005-1272

Gary L. Bostwick, Esq. Davis Wright Tremaine L.L.P. 865 South Figueroa Street, 24th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90017-2566

Victor Hlavinka, Esq. Atchley, Russell, Waldrop & Hlavinka, P.C. P.O. Box 5517 Texarkana, TX 75505-5517

Cedric D. Scott

EXHIBIT A

```
Gabriel Gelb
                                                         June 19, 2003
                                                           Page 1
                 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
  1
                  FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
  2
                         TEXARKANA DIVISION
  3
      SCOTT O'GRADY,
  4
               Plaintiff,
  5
      VS.
                                    CIVIL ACTION NO.
                                                      502CV173
  6
      TWENTIETH CENTURY FOX
      FILM CORPORATION, and
      DISCOVERY COMMUNICATIONS,
      INC.,
  8
               Defendants.
 9
               ************
10
                  ORAL AND VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION
11
                          GABRIEL M. GELB
                           JUNE 19, 2003
12
13
14
15
          ORAL AND VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION of GABRIEL M.
16
     GELB, produced as a witness at the instance of the
     Defendant, Twentieth Century Fox Film Corporation, and
17
     duly sworn, was taken in the above-styled and numbered
18
     cause on the 19th day of June, 2003, from 9:15 a.m. to
19
     4:53 p.m., before Rhonda K. Ashman, CSR, RPR, in and
20
     for the State of Texas, reported by stenographic
21
     means, at the offices of Locke, Liddell & Sapp, LLC,
22
23
     2200 Ross Avenue, Suite 2200, Dallas, Texas, pursuant
24
     to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the
25
     provisions stated on the record or attached hereto.
```

Gabriel Gelb

June 19, 2003

Page 8 Page 6 Q. And what cases were those? GABRIEL M. GELB, 1 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows: A. I don't -- I don't remember offhand. 2 2 Q. Okay. What about false endorsement, have you 3 EXAMINATION ever been retained as an expert to testify on matters BY MS. HAMILTON: 4 of false endorsement? 5 Q. Would you state your name for the record, A. No. 6 please. Q. What is your understanding of what the A. Gabriel Michael Gelb. 7 relevant population was? I think that was the term Q. Mr. Gelb, you've been retained as an expert that you were using. What - what is the relevant 0 in this case? 10 population that you were studying? 10 A. Yes, I have. A. In my mind, the relevant population were Q. And that is on behalf of the Plaintiff, Scott 11 11 people who had access to the Discovery Channel in the O'Grady? 12 12 13 time period that the disputed program was shown. 13 A. Yes. Q. And how did you arrive at that determination? 14 14 Q. Let me hand you first what's previously been marked as Exhibit Number 325, which is the notice of 15 A. Just seemed logical to me. 15 Q. No other reason other than it just seemed deposition. And ask you if you've had an opportunity 16 16 17 logical? to review that prior to today? 17 A. That's correct. 18 18 A. Yes, I have. Q. Okay. And did you bring any documents with 19 Q. And how did you determine who - and what was 19 the time frame that you're talking about? 20 you today? 20 21 A. Well, the disputed program was shown on 21 A. No. November 28th, 2001. So we wanted people who had 22 Q. Okay. Did you have an understanding 23 access to the Discovery Channel during that time already -- communications with counsel regarding 23 production of documents relating to your work in this 24 period and also were still watching the Discovery Channel recently. 25 Page 9 Q. And why was it relevant, if at all, that they A. Did I have an understanding? were still watching the Discovery Channel? Q. Did you have a discussion with counsel about 2 A. Just so that they would be familiar with the 3 production of documents that you worked on or that were part of your work in relation to this case? channel and still had access to it. Q. Was there anything else that you considered A. Yes. 5 Q. And have you produced all those documents? 6 other than you were looking for people who had access to the Discovery Channel as part of the relevant A. To the best of my knowledge. 7 population for your study? Q. Okay. How many times have you testified A. Well, there were certain qualifications that before in trial? A. In trial, about 10 or 12. 10 we screened for among those people who had access to 10 Q. Okay. And tell me what your understanding is the Discovery Channel. 11 11 O. And how did - well, first of all, what were of your duties in this lawsuit. 12 A. To conduct a survey to determine whether or 13 those qualifications? A. Those qualifications were people who had not 14 Enot certain allegations by Captain O'Grady were 14 taken part in a research survey in the past six months supported by the relevant population or not. 15 15 and - let's see, that - who - who were part of any Q. And what were those allegations that you were 16 16 17 17 entertainment company or video store. determining were supported or not? Q. Any other qualifications? A. Whether or not, after seeing the Discovery 18 19 A. No. Channel program, the relevant population believed that Captain O'Grady was endorsing the Twentieth Century 20 Q. What was the import, if anything, about having people who had not taken part in a survey in Fox film, Behind Enemy Lines, and whether or not they 21 thought that that film told his story. the last six months or past six months? A. Well, you generally don't want people who are Q. Have you ever been retained as an expert 23 professional surveyors, people who have been taking a regarding false advertising claims? 24 24

3 (Pages 6 to 9)

A. I think so, maybe once or twice before.

25

lot of surveys. You try to get a little bit more of a

Gabriel Gelb

June 19, 2003

j	·		
1	Page 26	1	D 20
1	-	١.	Page 28
1 2	apparently came from Discovery Channel.	1	
l 3	Q. And why do you say it "apparently came from	2	and a second tabe min was broaded to
1 4	Discovery Channel ⁿ ?	3	
5		4	
6		5	commercials in it.
1 7	the same same and same see	6	Q. So it was not a complete program either?
8		7	A. That's correct.
وا		8	Q. Did there come a time - what was provided to
10		9	you after that, if anything?
11		10	
12	to (= = ================================	11	e
13		12	were - there were more than one tape?
		13	A. There were eight tapes.
14	citing Bates numbers. That's -	14	Well and the control of the cont
15		15	they eight of the same tape?
16		16	A. Same tape.
17	The second secon	17	Q. Okay. And did you view that tape?
18	F	18	A. Yes, I did.
19		19	Q. Okay. And what was your assessment of that
20		20	tape?
21		21	A. In what sense? There was com
22		22	Q. Did it meet the criteria?
23		23	A. It it was a complete tape. It was a
24	July 2 To the to Me.	24	complete tape of the program.
25	A. (Witness complies.)	25	Q. Let me hand you this tape. And again, we'll
L		l	
1 -			
1			
	Page 71		
	Page 27		Fage 29
1 2	Q. Thanks.	1	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to
2	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than	2	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was
3	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the	2 3	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel.
2 3 4	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that	2 3 4	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe
2 3 4 5	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated	2 3 4 5	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the
2 3 4 5 6	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning?	2 3 4 5 6	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes?
2 3 4 5 6 7	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct.	2 3 4 5 6 7	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.)
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn. Q. And what was the result of that conversation?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been marked as Exhibit 328 is the I guess it was the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn. Q. And what was the result of that conversation? A. Well, he sent me this second tape and I had	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been marked as Exhibit 328 is the I guess it was the third tape that you received from Counsel?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn. Q. And what was the result of that conversation? A. Well, he sent me this second tape and I had the same reaction.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been marked as Exhibit 328 is the I guess it was the third tape that you received from Counsel? A. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn. Q. And what was the result of that conversation? A. Well, he sent me this second tape and I had the same reaction. Q. And that's the tape that you referred to as	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been marked as Exhibit 328 is the I guess it was the third tape that you received from Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And you said that it met the criteria.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn. Q. And what was the result of that conversation? A. Well, he sent me this second tape and I had the same reaction. Q. And that's the tape that you referred to as the DCI tape?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe — Q. That was one of the eight that — one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been marked as Exhibit 328 is the — I guess it was the third tape that you received from Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And you said that it met the criteria. What was the criteria?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn. Q. And what was the result of that conversation? A. Well, he sent me this second tape and I had the same reaction. Q. And that's the tape that you referred to as the DCI tape? A. Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe — Q. That was one of the eight that — one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been marked as Exhibit 328 is the — I guess it was the third tape that you received from Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And you said that it met the criteria. What was the criteria? A. It seemed to be a complete tape with the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn. Q. And what was the result of that conversation? A. Well, he sent me this second tape and I had the same reaction. Q. And that's the tape that you referred to as the DCI tape? A. Yes. Q. And why did you — first of all, as to the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe — Q. That was one of the eight that — one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been marked as Exhibit 328 is the — I guess it was the third tape that you received from Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And you said that it met the criteria. What was the criteria? A. It seemed to be a complete tape with the opening talking about the movie and then seguing into
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn. Q. And what was the result of that conversation? A. Well, he sent me this second tape and I had the same reaction. Q. And that's the tape that you referred to as the DCI tape? A. Yes. Q. And why did you — first of all, as to the first tape, why couldn't — why was it your opinion	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been marked as Exhibit 328 is the I guess it was the third tape that you received from Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And you said that it met the criteria. What was the criteria? A. It seemed to be a complete tape with the opening talking about the movie and then seguing into the Discovery Channel Scott O'Grady program with
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn. Q. And what was the result of that conversation? A. Well, he sent me this second tape and I had the same reaction. Q. And that's the tape that you referred to as the DCI tape? A. Yes. Q. And why did you — first of all, as to the first tape, why couldn't — why was it your opinion that you couldn't show that tape?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe Q. That was one of the eight that one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been marked as Exhibit 328 is the I guess it was the third tape that you received from Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And you said that it met the criteria. What was the criteria? A. It seemed to be a complete tape with the opening talking about the movie and then seguing into the Discovery Channel Scott O'Grady program with commercials for other entities interspersed in the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. Thanks. And at this point in time, other than conferences with Counsel, you had looked at the complaint and you had looked at the first tape that was given to you that you said was sort of a truncated beginning? A. That's correct. Q. Did you ask for any other materials? A. No. I mean, I said, at that point, that we did not have a tape that we could show. Q. And you're referring to the first tape, that truncated tape? A. That's correct. Q. And who did you have that conversation with? A. Mr. Flynn. Q. And what was the result of that conversation? A. Well, he sent me this second tape and I had the same reaction. Q. And that's the tape that you referred to as the DCI tape? A. Yes. Q. And why did you — first of all, as to the first tape, why couldn't — why was it your opinion	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	look at it, if you have to. Repre represent to you that that's my understanding of the tape that was given to you by Counsel. A. I believe — Q. That was one of the eight that — one of the eight tapes? A. I believe it is. Q. Okay. MS. HAMILTON: Let's go ahead and mark that. You know what, you better put it on the tape itself in case it gets out of the box. That's 328. (Exhibit Number 328 marked.) Q. (BY MS. HAMILTON) And so what has been marked as Exhibit 328 is the — I guess it was the third tape that you received from Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And you said that it met the criteria. What was the criteria? A. It seemed to be a complete tape with the opening talking about the movie and then seguing into

Gabriel Gelb

June 19, 2003

`		P. 40		
		Page 30	1	Page 32
)	1	the movie itself.	1	·
ı	2	Q. And do you have an understanding of where	2	
1	4	this tape came from?	3	tape be complete. What do you mean by "complete"?
1	5	A. Mr. Flynn.	4	A. I mean that the second tape apparently, as I
3	6	Q. Okay. Do you know whether it was produced by	5	said before, did not have commercials in it for other
ı	7	any of the parties or how did it - you know, if you say strike one on the first tape that you got that was	6	than the movie, so we did not have the localized
- [8	truncated, strike two on the second tape, the DCI tape	7	retail and other commercials inserted in that.
1	9	because it didn't have the movie commercials, and then	8	Q. Okay. And - and why was it important to
ı		you go back, number three works, that — that meets	9	have those other commercials included in the tape?
1	11	your criteria. Do you know how what the origin was	10 11	The state of the s
١	12	of that tape?	12	
1	13	A. I know the origin of part of it.	13	ti =) · j ou minute any onto to to to to
۱	14	Q. Okay. And this is part of the tape which has	14	other copies of this — of the tape of the program as
1	15	been marked Exhibit 328?	15	aired on December 28th - I'm sorry, November 28th A. No.
-	16	A. Is that the last tape?	16	•
	17	Q. Yes.	17	A. No.
	18	A. It was my understanding that the last tape	18	Q. So you made no independent effort to obtain
1	19	included the material that was in the original tape	19	the tape from Dec November 28th, 2001?
	20	given to me.	20	A. No.
1	21	Q. It included the material in the original	21	Q. Okay. But it was important to you that you
1	22	tape, but did it also include other material?	22	show the participants the tape as aired on
İ	23	A. No. You asked me what was in that tape. I	23	November 28th, 2001; is that correct?
ı	24	said that what I know is that part of the tape was the	24	A. Yes.
1	25	same as I originally saw in the first tape and	25	Q. And why was it important?
-			ļ	
		Page 31	ļ.	Page 33
	1		1	
	2	Page 31 which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends.	1 2	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing
1		which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends.	2	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a
	3 4	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape?	•	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was
	2 3 4 5	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape.	3	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown.
	2 3 4 5 6	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came	2 3 4	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population
	2 3 4 5 6 7	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn.	2 3 4 5	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's – the tape is	2 3 4 5 6	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's – the tape is labeled a combined – November 28th combined Discovery	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's – the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct?
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. To me it was obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001?
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what were you told?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001? A. Would you repeat the question?
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 4 15 16 17	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what were you told? A. That it was the original tape that I saw,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001? A. Would you repeat the question? Q. Did you consider the population that was
***************************************	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 4 15 16 17 18 19 10 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what were you told?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001? A. Would you repeat the question? Q. Did you consider the population that was watching the Discovery Channel on November 28th of
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 4 15 16 17 18 19 10 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what were you told? A. That it was the original tape that I saw, plus they had gotten the front part of the program added to that tape.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001? A. Would you repeat the question? Q. Did you consider the population that was watching the Discovery Channel on November 28th of 2001?
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 4 15 16 17 18 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's – the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what were you told? A. That it was the original tape that I saw, plus they had gotten the front part of the program added to that tape. Q. And do you know who added that to the tape? A. No.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001? A. Would you repeat the question? Q. Did you consider the population that was watching the Discovery Channel on November 28th of 2001? A. I thought about whether or not that would be
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's – the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what were you told? A. That it was the original tape that I saw, plus they had gotten the front part of the program added to that tape. Q. And do you know who added that to the tape? A. No. Q. And do you know where it came from?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001? A. Would you repeat the question? Q. Did you consider the population that was watching the Discovery Channel on November 28th of 2001?
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 22	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what were you told? A. That it was the original tape that I saw, plus they had gotten the front part of the program added to that tape. Q. And do you know who added that to the tape? A. No. Q. And do you know where it came from? A. No.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001? A. Would you repeat the question? Q. Did you consider the population that was watching the Discovery Channel on November 28th of 2001? A. I thought about whether or not that would be possible to find those people, but then I gave that up as impractical.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 22 23	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what were you told? A. That it was the original tape that I saw, plus they had gotten the front part of the program added to that tape. Q. And do you know who added that to the tape? A. No. Q. And do you know where it came from? A. No. Q. Okay. But you were satisfied to take the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes: Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001? A. Would you repeat the question? Q. Did you consider the population that was watching the Discovery Channel on November 28th of 2001? A. I thought about whether or not that would be possible to find those people, but then I gave that up as impractical. Q. Did you consider the demographics of the Discovery Channel of November 28th, 2001?
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 22 23	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what were you told? A. That it was the original tape that I saw, plus they had gotten the front part of the program added to that tape. Q. And do you know who added that to the tape? A. No. Q. And do you know where it came from? A. No.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes. Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001? A. Would you repeat the question? Q. Did you consider the population that was watching the Discovery Channel on November 28th of 2001? A. I thought about whether or not that would be possible to find those people, but then I gave that up as impractical.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 22 23	which I understand was made by one of Captain O'Grady's friends. Q. Okay. Do you know the source of Exhibit 328? A. Is that the third tape? Q. Yes, that's the third tape. A. I don't know where the beginning portion came from, except that it was given to me by Mr. Flynn. Q. Okay. And in fact, it's — the tape is labeled a combined — November 28th combined Discovery Channel? A. Yes, it is. Q. Okay. So is it a combination of tapes? A. I believe so. Q. Okay. And were you told that by Counsel? A. Yes. Q. Okay. And what were you told? A. That it was the original tape that I saw, plus they had gotten the front part of the program added to that tape. Q. And do you know who added that to the tape? A. No. Q. And do you know where it came from? A. No. Q. Okay. But you were satisfied to take the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A. To me it was — obviously, if you're testing what the relevant population might take away from a program, you'd want them to see the program that was shown. Q. Okay. When you say the relevant population was taking away — what they were taking away from the program? A. That's right. Q. And again, in your mind, the relevant population were just people who had access to the Discovery Channel through cable television; is that correct? A. Yes: Q. Did you consider the population of viewers of the Discovery Channel on November 28th, 2001? A. Would you repeat the question? Q. Did you consider the population that was watching the Discovery Channel on November 28th of 2001? A. I thought about whether or not that would be possible to find those people, but then I gave that up as impractical. Q. Did you consider the demographics of the Discovery Channel of November 28th, 2001?

Gabriel Gelb June 19, 2003 Page 230 Page 232 I, GABRIEL M. GELB, have read the foregoing the deposition, the Deponent deposition and hereby affix my signature that same is and/or the 2 Plaintiff/Defendant did not 3 true and correct, except as noted above. 3 request to review the transcript. Certified to by me this day of 5 , 2003. GABRIEL M. GELB 6 STATE OF 8 8 COUNTY OF 9 RHONDA K. ASHMAN, Texas CSR 5259 10 10 Expiration Date: 12-31-03 11 day personally appeared GABRIEL M. GELB, known to me 11 ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES 12 (or proved to me under oath or through 703 McKinney Avenue 13 12) to be the person whose name is Suite 320 subscribed to the foregoing instrument and 14 Dallas, Texas 75202 acknowledged to me that they executed the same for the 13 15 (800) 852-9737 14 16 purpose and consideration therein expressed. 15 Given under my hand and seal of office this 17 16 18 day of . 2003. 19 17 18 20 19 NOTARY PUBLIC IN AND FOR 20 THE STATE OF 21 22 22 23 23 24 24 25 25 Page 231 Page 233 STATE OF TEXAS) COURT REPORTER DISCLOSURE STATEMENT 2 be advised that pursuant to Rule IV.B4 of is and rules for certification of Certified 3 I, Rhonda K. Ashman, Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for the State of Texas, do hereby certify that, 5 pursuant to the agreement hereinbefore set forth, there came before me on the 19th day of June, A.D., 7 2003 at 9:15 a.m., at Locke, Liddell & Sapp, in the 8 City of Dallas, County of Dallas, and State of Texas, the following named person to-wit: Gabriel M. Gelb, who was by me duly sworn to testify the truth and nothing but the truth of his knowledge touching and 11 12 concerning the matters in controversy in this cause; and that he was thereupon carefully examined upon his 13 14 oath and his examination reduced to writing under my ij supervision; that the deposition is a true record of 15 16 the testimony given by the witness, same to be sworn 15 to and subscribed by said witness before any Notary 17 es June 19, 2003 16 17 Public, pursuant to the agreement of the parties. 18 am CSE RPR 19 I further certify that I am neither attorney or 18 counsel for, nor related to or employed by, any of the 20 21 parties to the action in which this deposition is taken, and further that I am not a relative or 22 23 employee of any attorney or counsel by the parties 22 23 24 hereto, or financially interested in the action. K. Ashman CSP PPE 24 25 25 I further certify that before the completion of

59 (Pages 230 to 233)

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS TEXARKANA DIVISION

SCOTT O'GRADY,	§
Plaintiff,	§ §
v.	§ CIVIL ACTION NO. 502CV173
TWENTIETH CENTURY FOX FILM CORPORATION, and	8 § JURY DEMANDED 8
DISCOVERY COMMUNICATIONS, INC.,	§ ORAL ARGUMENT REQUESTED
Defendants.	§ §

ORDER RULING ON PLAINTIFF'S MOTION IN LIMINE

Before the Court is Plaintiff's Motion in Limine and Brief in Support. Having considered the Motion, Defendants Twentieth Century Fox Film Corporation and Discovery Communications, Inc.'s Response to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine and Brief in Support, and the arguments of counsel, the Court hereby rules on Plaintiff's Motion in Limine as follows:

Plaintiff's Motion In Limine No. 6: Any testimony regarding Fox's	Granted	Denied
Principles.		
Plaintiff's Motion In Limine No. 7: Any testimony alleging that the videotape shown as a stimulus to the participants of the Gelb Survey was not a fair representation of the November 28 th Rebroadcast of <i>Behind Enemy Lines: the Scott O'Grady Story</i> . Plaintiff's Motion In Limine No. 10: Any reference to the First Amendment to the United States Constitution.		

SIGNED this_	day of	·
		UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE